

EMPOWERMENT OR IMPOVERISHMENT?  
AN EVALUATION OF THE IMPACT OF  
DEVELOPMENT  
AGENCIES AND CHURCH / MISSIONARY  
ACTIVITY IN THE  
NORTH WEST PROVINCE OF ZAMBIA

J O Harries

A dissertation submitted to the school of  
Development Studies of the University of  
East Anglia in part fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of Master of  
Arts in Rural Development.

September 1992

## INTRODUCTION

My own interest in NWPZ (North West Province of Zambia) derives from having spent three years working for the ECZ (Evangelical Church in Zambia) as a teacher of agriculture at Mukinge Girls Secondary School near Kasempa. I began in August 1988, convinced that my agricultural training would enable me to 'help' the people in Zambia to improve their food production, and thus reduce the problems of poverty and malnutrition so often associated with Africa. I set about doing this, teaching at the school, learning the local language (Kikaonde) and spending time with local people. In an endeavour to improve my understanding, I carried out a survey asking for opinions on the best way forward for the development of the province (Appendix C). Having begun with the conviction that the answer was in technology, I was forced to realise that the impediments to economic development, were not primarily technical or even financial, but that the local culture determined a certain life for the people, which resulted in conditions which from the West would be described as poor or underdeveloped.

Making this realisation forced me to ask by what means development could occur? It became increasingly apparent that the most effective way for me to enable social and economic development was by promoting the Christian gospel. It is this which is explored in this thesis, taking the NWPZ as a case study, but including references to other parts of Africa. In sociological terms, it is a contribution to the debate between Marxist and Weberian schools of thought. (For a discussion of some of the more theoretical issues associated with the view that Christianity is itself the developing agent see Appendix D.)

I compare the activities and impact of the protestant missions and those of secular development organisations in NWPZ. Most development initiatives by secular bodies to date in the province, have failed to meet their objectives. I examine the reason for these failures. I then examine the impact of missionaries, and indigenous Christian churches comparing this with that of the secular organisations. In the final section, I take a critical view on missionary activity in the province, suggesting that much of the criticism that has in the past been addressed against missionaries has been as a result of misunderstanding, especially of the culture of the indigenous people, but

also that missionaries must be careful to keep working to biblical directives, and not be misled by secular thinking.

The missions and churches I am going to refer to mostly, which are strong in the NWPZ, are protestant and evangelical. I am not going to comment on what the impact of other denominations / religions may have been in this situation, although this would be an interesting avenue to explore. I suggest that much of what is described here for NWPZ will also be relevant for other parts of Africa.

A particular problem I have met in the writing of this thesis, is in knowing what terminology to use in describing various characteristics of peoples culture, be it European or African, which is not offensive. I believe that differences between cultures do exist, it is ignoring them which contributes to much misunderstanding, that this misunderstanding has been negative in effect, and that comparisons between cultures are therefore justified. Nowhere is it intended to be implied that one cultural trait is inherently superior to another. Any comments that may appear to indicate such are a reflection of the fact that I am looking at the process of 'development', defined broadly as progress towards Western life and values, without saying that this way is either desirable or in any way superior to other ways of living. That I leave the reader to consider.

I have used the term 'traditional' to describe the values and culture still found amongst people in rural areas, which also have an effect on the worldview of those who have come out of the rural way of life. I have drawn on authors writing some years back for information in this area, for example Richards, 1939 and Melland, 1923, in so far as the way of life they ascribe to people they have studied equates with my own knowledge of the rural Kaonde today.

Some of the suggestions I make are radical. This I believe to be justified. The situation is serious, the lives of many people are at stake, and the record for development to date in NWPZ is extremely poor.

## Chapter 1. GEOGRAPHY, HISTORY AND PEOPLE OF THE NORTH WEST PROVINCE OF ZAMBIA

I will lay out some background information to the NWPZ in this chapter.

### 1.1 Geographical background

Most of the province is covered by miombo woodlands, sparse fire resistant trees of poor quality, usually with the ground being grass covered. The 1000 to 1500 mm of annual rainfall is highly seasonal, almost all of it falling between October and April. Some of the best soils in the province are found in Kasempa district, the pockets of red clay being especially valuable (Jaeger, 1981). Soil quality generally deteriorates to the west.

The NWPZ borders with Zaire to the north, and Angola to the west. The eastern boundary is the Copperbelt province. Part of the Kafue game park is found in the south of the province. The province is between 10 and 15 degrees south of the equator.

### 1.2 Historical background

The province suffered neglect under British colonial rule (Wilkin, 1983). There are some minerals, notably at Kansanshi and Kalengwa mines, but the lack of good transport facilities has hindered their exploitation.

Two missions have been active in NWPZ since the beginning of this century. They are both evangelical by persuasion. The Brethren are known locally as the CMML (Christian Mission in Many Lands), and set up their first mission station in the province in 1906. The churches resulting from the work of this mission are known as brethren or CMML churches. The AEF (Africa Evangelical Fellowship, previously SAGM) established itself in the province in 1910 (it is with this latter mission that I am most familiar). The ECZ (Evangelical Church in Zambia) has grown out of the work of the AEF. The popularity of these missions has not been universal, Wilkin (1983) being especially critical of them for their reluctance to be involved in schooling, and in the provision of other social services. In addition, the Watchtower sect has been actively spread by indigenous

prophets over the years, having first been in the province in about 1913 (Hooker, 1965).

### 1.3 NWPZ today

The NWPZ has a population of 383,000 (1990) in an area of 125,000 square kilometres, ie an average of about 3 people per square kilometre. Kasempa district itself is even more sparsely populated with a population estimated in 1990 as 37,000 in an area of about 33,000 square kilometres giving a population density of 1.12 per square kilometre (CSO, 1990b).

A varied cultivation pattern is a reflection of the presence of different cultural groups. The Kaonde occupying the east of the province prefer sorghum as their staple. They are hunters by tradition. The Lunda, found mostly to the north, share the hunting tradition, but prefer to eat cassava. Unlike the Lunda or Kaonde, the Luvale, to the west, have a long tradition as traders (Short, 1972) and grow cassava, and along the Zambezi also rice. The Luvale people are also renowned for being cattle keepers, unlike the Lunda and Kaonde, partly due to the prevalence of tse tse fly where the latter live. The other language groups found to a lesser extent in the NWPZ are the Ndembu, Mbundu, Chokwe, and Luchazi (Jaeger, 1981).

There have been efforts by various development organisations to 'develop' the people of NWPZ (see Chapter 2). By 1991, most expatriates had left, and apart from some residual activity from a few, the remaining influence from the outside world was coming primarily through the government, the ECZ (Evangelical Church in Zambia) and Brethren churches. Other denominations are now also found, especially Catholics. The Watchtower continue to be a strong independent church.

### 1.4 Political and economic context

The NWPZ is today still known as the most backward province in the country, perhaps with Luapula province. There are few roads or services. It is not helped by the poor economic plight of Zambia as a whole.

The country of Zambia has been in a state of economic decline since the mid 1970s. According to CSO, 1990a, per capita GDP has been falling at an annual average of 2.8 per

cent. The copper mines have been the main foreign exchange earner, but have been suffering from a fall in income since the mid 1970s, this usually being attributed to falling copper prices. The rate of inflation has risen in every year but one from 1982 to 1989, in which year it stood at 122 per cent. As far back as 1980 an International Labour Organisation survey estimated that 80 per cent of Zambian rural households did not have sufficient income to meet their basic needs (CSO, 1990a).

Having been neglected in the past, and with the recent trend of the application of Structural Adjustment Policy by the IMF (International Monetary Fund) on African nations, which is promoting free market conditions, I am going to assume the environment in NWPZ will continue to be one with very few opportunities for trade, and one in which there will therefore be very little sustainable outside intervention. It will increasingly be only those interventions that have promoted ideological and value change which will have an ongoing impact.

Annotations for maps

Fig. 1.1 Zambia in the geographical context of Africa, Europe and Asia.

EUROPE            ASIA            AFRICA            ATLANTIC OCEAN  
INDIAN OCEAN    Zambia

Fig. 1.2 The North West Province in Zambia.

North West Province boundary

Fig. 1.3 North West Province by district.

Zambezi            Mwinilunga            Solwezi            Kasempa  
Mufumbwe            Kabompo

Fig. 1.4 Language groups in the North West Province of Zambia

LUVALE            LUNDA            KAONDE  
NDEMBU            MBUNDU            CHOKWE            LUCHAZI

(Lunda, Kaonde and Luvale are official Zambian languages)

## Chapter 2. CULTURAL CONSERVATISM AND THE FAILURE OF DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVES

Their culture is not something people give up easily. That is probably just as well.

### 2.1 Development initiatives in the NWPZ

Since independence in 1964 many attempts have been made by various organisations at 'development' in the NWPZ, some of which are listed below. I would contend that none of them have even come close to achieving their stated medium or long term development objectives. (See Appendix A.)

a. DAPP (Danish Aid from People to People) have a 'front line youth project' near Solwezi. Having started the project in the mid 1980s, the last Danish personnel left in 1989. Many buildings and productive enterprises have been set up, such as a dairy herd, wood and metal workshops, classrooms, offices, etc. By 1991 there were no functioning vehicles, a handful of dairy cows, no running water, no diesel and therefore no electricity etc. (Personal observation and in conversations 1990 and 1991).

b. Dutch volunteers had been in Kasempa district for a long time, involved primarily in community health. The last Dutch nurse left in 1990 / 1991. The service of the rural health clinics has become increasingly poor. (In conversation, Jaeger, 1992 and others).

c. NORAD (the Norwegian development organisation) has had projects in Mwinilunga district, all of which appear now to have failed to prove sustainable, the last NORAD worker having left in 1991. At the time of his leaving he said "This is a difficult area to work in. My work has not contributed to development. ... I do not recommend anyone to replace me in my current capacity." (Anderson, 1991).

d. GTZ (the German development organisation) has had an Integrated Rural Development Programme (IRDP) based in Kabompo. It was started in the 1970s, and is now being run down. (Pijnenburg, 1991).

e. IFAD has provided funding for a similar project, based in Solwezi, which all expatriates have left, and which is now running down (In conversation with project staff).

f. ZACTS, the Zambian Agricultural and Crafts Training Institute, was started near Solwezi in 1985. Corruption and misappropriation of funds has resulted in the donors withdrawing all but the minimum amount of support, and no further progress, at least up to April 1991. (Personal observation and conversations).

g. There were major resettlement schemes operated in Kasempa District. Despite much effort, especially by Dutch volunteers, there are now few services associated with them. (Personal observation). For details see Jaeger, 1981.

The reasons for the failures will become apparent in the reading of this thesis. They can be put into two broad categories, political and cultural. The former has been much studied in the literature, and is important. Nevertheless, the one which I suggest is more fruitful to study is the latter. Political forces cannot be done away with, but their nature is determined by values, which are derived from culture, itself closely linked with religion (see subsequent chapters).

Clay and Schaffer, 1984, following discussion of the nature of development intervention in the Third World, tell us that "It is self awareness which is the cornerstone of responsible policy practice." (My emphasis). The "self awareness" being referred to here I suggest is awareness of one's own culture, especially the way it differs from that of the people 'being developed', and the way in which it determines one's behaviour and activities.

Perhaps in the light of the above critique, it is also necessary to criticise missionary activity, or the work of the church? It is however not liable to criticism in the same way as are the secular organisations. It is possible to criticise development by the latter, by comparing outcomes with objectives, the objectives being stated explicitly, development being seen as a means towards a defined end. Not so with the missionaries, who work on the basis of a call, and in service, for whom the means is itself the end. The objective is anyway of course not 'development' in the material sense, but spiritual. Criticism could thus (rightly or wrongly) be directed

against the failure (or otherwise) to establish an indigenous church or convert a given number of people. This however falls outside the remit of this thesis. We must be content instead to examine the 'impact' of missions by comparison with that of secular organisations.

## 2.2 Culture and development

I will look first below at the nature of success and failure in development. Secondly at some examples of values that have a direct impact on effectiveness of work on a task or project, to indicate that culture cannot be taken as neutral, but should be seen as critical in determining the course or feasibility of change. Thirdly, I intend to point out that it is the failure to realise this, and the strength of cultural conservatism in NWPZ, which has led to the failure of much development intervention working on a materialist basis to date.

### a. A different view on success in development

There is always a question as to what criteria should be applied in the evaluation of a project. I am not going to provide a categorical answer to that question here. A useful guideline from Goulet, 1971, is that development should be concerned with the freedom, life sustenance, and esteem of the people.

The view of nationals on development intervention can be very different from the Western one, as illustrated by Nelson Richards, 1978, referring to the Chonga irrigation scheme in Zambia. He tells us that "...planners and organisers...are not able in any meaningful way to communicate with the peasant farmers ... Introduction of 'experts' into Africa in order to instruct what to do and how to do it may always have little or no result." His view of the white man is especially revealing: "The white man in Northern Rhodesia while seen as a "Bwana" and therefore must be treated with fear and respect was secretly despised because of his utter and absolute disrespect and disgusting contempt not only for the black man as a person, but more his culture ..." The white man who thinks he is 'doing good' could do well to have recourse to Aristotle, 1976: "What makes a man just and temperate is not just that he does just and temperate things, but also that he does them in the way a just and temperate man would do."

I have no reason to believe that similar views are not held by many people in NWPZ. As long as 'development' continues to be imposed as it has been in the past, it will be received with minimal appreciation.

I am personally inclined to view even apparent and short term 'successes' also as 'failures'. Is it not a matter of shame, and not pride, for people to deny their family, community and cultural history for the sake of material gain as offered by protagonists of Western development? This was made plain to me, when a Zambian colleague explained on one occasion that he did not like to associate with whites. The reason he gave, was that his fellows would understand this action on his part as rapacious, and he would be viewed suspiciously by them as a result.

Instead of working with and assisting in the organic development of their communities, the 'best' educated young people in NWPZ are often attracted by the lure of high salaries, and spend their time following the whims of whichever funding organisation happens to have taken them on in a 'development' activity (1). The efforts of other people can also be drawn, usually by means of financial or prestige inducements, into futile activities, supposedly for the common good (2). These are just two reasons why, I suggest, development projects not only fail, they also handicap the capacity for development and change which could come from within a community.

Many of the organisations involved in development in NWPZ and elsewhere have a policy of training people, in order to work themselves out of the job (eg FRG, no date). They hope that they can train people within a few years to take over something that is designed almost entirely from the West, and based on Western values. It is of course possible, (although not easy), to impart technical information in this sort of time scale. The especial difficulty is with values such as those in Table 2.1, which cannot simply be taught. This is clearly demonstrated in the failure of the Mumena frontline youth project near Solwezi (3).

#### b. Work related values

There are many values which are so basic to life in the West, that Westerners are inclined to believe that they are universal (Stanley 1990). It has been my observation, that there are significant differences between people in NWPZ,

and those of Western origin, in some of the values they hold, which affect the way in which, for example, work is done. This is not to say that they are either better or worse, but they can nevertheless have a major effect on the course of development. Some of these are listed in Table 2.1 below.

I suggest that values in the right hand column are more conducive to development along Western capitalist lines. The differences in values explain why, especially in colonial days, Zambians very often (wrongly) got a name among the some Europeans for being 'lazy' (eg Short, 1972). The crucial point I suggest is that one precondition for development to occur which satisfies European managers, on the lines of what Clay and Schaffer (1984) call the 'mainstream model', would be a major value system change on the part of the people of NWPZ.

Table 2.1. Values important to economic development which differ between traditional NWPZ and 'modern' Western culture.

NWPZ	WESTERN
<p>Relatives            Relatives must be attended to even if it means the job is neglected.</p>	<p>Job            The job is more likely to take priority, and relatives are taken care of in another way.</p>
<p>People            If doing a task, and circumstance, a visitor comes, the task is more likely to be put aside in order to greet the person.</p>	<p>Time            In the same the visitor is likely to receive less attention, unless he is of some particular importance.</p>
<p>Process            It is important that a completed good working relationship means is maintained at all times suffer. The in the carrying out of a task.</p>	<p>Product            The task must be at all costs, even if it that relationships end justifies the means.</p>
<p>Sharing            It is good to share what you have with your family important and colleagues. people</p>	<p>Accumulation            The ability to accumulate as an individual is as an incentive for to work hard.</p>

c. Cultural conservatism

I am not saying that such value change is desirable. Nevertheless, much of the failure of so called development taking hold can be clearly understood in the light of deeply rooted behavioural norms. Some of these are examined below.

I will take here the conventional view, of perceiving the NWPZ from a Western perspective. The reader should bear in mind that a similar account could also be written by someone from a different cultural perspective, about the cultural conservatism of the Westerner (4).

(i) Health Changes in state of health are generally ascribed to social and not biological phenomena. If someone becomes ill, or if they die, the reason for this may be sought in the community. Very often witchcraft, or the failure to carry out a certain rite will be blamed. Ameliorative measures will take the form of counter-magic, action directly against the person thought to be responsible, (these are things I was told frequently in talking to NWPZ people) or the rectification of some failure to follow a traditional practice.

The fact that rural clinics are poorly maintained can be understood in the light of the peoples belief that disease is due to social and not biological causes. Biologically oriented medical services are not seen as reducing the prevalence of disease, so are not going to be sufficiently valued by local people to ensure their good maintenance (5). Gluckman, 1970: "White doctors are very good at treating disease, but while they cure the disease, they don't treat the witchcraft which caused the disease, and that will continue to do harm."

(ii) Food and diet Food production is traditionally oriented to subsistence. There is very little incentive for one person to produce more than this, as they will only be required to share any surplus with those relatives who make demands upon them. As a further disincentive to increasing production, those who manage to produce a lot more food than their colleagues are likely to be accused of being witches (Mayer, 1970, Berendson, 1991). The social ostracism and fear resulting deters them.

So we therefore have a situation in which production levels are almost invariably kept to a minimal level. There are also reasons as to why, even when adequate food is available, it is not necessarily consumed in a way which avoids malnutrition. Sometimes cereal grains will be used for brewing beer, even if there is not enough to eat (Richards, 1939). Funeral attendance, and other socially desirable activities upset the routine of eating meals.

Children, who are considered by modern medical understanding to have the greatest need for a varied and 'nutritious' diet, may be the last to eat, and especially in the case of the small children, are given leftover food. In some cases this may be only nshima (the porridge made of the cereal, typically sorghum or maize), which is of particularly low nutritional value. Such a situation cannot be altered easily by mere education (see Chapter 3).

(iii) View of time The 'Western' view of time, is as a linear process. This means it is possible to look forward in time to predict and make plans which result in changes or improvements in society. This is much more difficult with the cyclical view of time (Turner, 1980).

This sees security not as looking forward and predicting what will happen in the future, but looking back and following courses of action which have succeeded in the past; Turner, 1980: "Security lay in conservation of resources and norms of the past, in repelling anything that might destroy these, rather than working for a better, ampler future on a new model". Although this is difficult to understand for someone who has always had a very linear view, it leaves people vulnerable to unexpected changes. This cyclical view of time appears to be widely held in NWPZ.

An example which I believe illustrates this different view on time in my own experience, is the way in which market prices are seen as fixed (for a given season), and those raising them, even in response to inflation, being seen as exploitative. Why should market prices vary from year to year after all?

This view of time clearly leaves people in a weak position in a changing society. Elsewhere in the world populations have been known to simply 'die out' as a result of the changes brought about by Westernization. An example of this is the Tasmanians, whose thinking was so steeped in tradition that they could not adapt to the new circumstances in which they found themselves on colonisation by Westerners (Burnett, 1990).

There is a notion, which has now been popularized in the West, that the people of Africa and in 'traditional' societies, are so pressed for time that despite working hard all hours of the day they are still unable to produce

enough to make a good living. In a limited sense this is true, perhaps especially of certain families. In the vast majority of cases the situation is not as simple. The Kaonde speakers are keen hunters, so the men like to go into the bush to hunt game no matter what the time of year, and this can prove a major handicap to improved crop production (Manyando, 1990). From personal observation, the people of NWPZ, probably no different from people anywhere, enjoy one another's company. They talk as they work if they can. The job is made to stretch to fit the time available. I have already mentioned that only that amount of work is done, as is considered necessary for subsistence. Additional time is used for other purposes, ie 'leisure'.

This examination of time and production already makes it clear why technologically based development is ineffective at raising food production, without it coming in hand with other changes in social and economic circumstances. A similar argument based on Lesotho is described in Low, 1986.

### 2.3 Why development intervention continues in the light of widespread failure

Having examined examples of cultural conservatism above, I now want to look a bit more broadly at why it is that efforts put into development intervention by the West have not been curtailed on realisation of this conservatism.

We can learn from the history of Nigeria, as reported by Ayandele 1967. He compares the policy of the British colonialists before and after 1906. Before, he identifies the dominant view as being "...the great hope for this country is the spread of Christianity...a genuine heart change followed by a change of life and mind." After 1906, western materialism "... was becoming a much stronger force than the abstract moral principles of the Christian missions."

The 20th Century view of development therefore became, and still is, very much a material one (6). This fails to take account of the importance of culture in determining the course of development and the importance of religion in determining culture (see Chapter 3). That some historians can be seen to have similarly neglected the vital role Christianity played in the development of the West is implied by Hall, 1959: "We only insist that an examination of these currents and tides of religious thought and

feeling cannot be passed by, without serious misinterpretation of American life." It is this materialist view that underlies many of the errors in attempts at imposing development in other parts of the world. The refusal to accept the inadequacy of this view prevents protagonists from looking outside it to find the reasons for failure, and the means to improvement.

Clay and Schaffer, (1984) tell us that the mainstream model of development, seems to be exactly what is wanted by the experts using it. Implementation can be safely left on one side. "The persistence and weight of the policy processes, practices and presentations that we have looked at are very powerful indeed." In other words the continuation of development intervention is not based on its proven efficacy, but on its attractiveness to experts, and the desirability of the supposed end.

Development initiatives continue because the West considers itself to have a moral obligation to help in the Third world, based perhaps on overvaluation of material gain and a guilty conscience which is derived in part from a misunderstanding of bible passages and an inappropriate application of Kantian philosophy (see Appendix B).

Some in the West remain aware of the more complex difficulties in development. The means they use to correct the situation are however often more damaging than helpful. They are inclined to try to monitor what is happening, so as to keep the field workers accountable for the funds they receive (Nicholds, 1992b). Monitoring an operation thousands of miles distant, in a hostile environment and unfamiliar culture, is however a fraught activity. The means often found to do this are the identification of so called 'verifiable indicators', ie quantifiable proxy which can be measured to show how well a project is doing (Casley and Kumar, 1987). The very notion that something as broad as 'development' can be quantitatively measured in this way, would be enough to make any long dead moral philosopher turn in his grave. What it in fact does is to orient those managing the development initiatives to direct their activities even more strongly, not to the local people whom they supposedly serve, but to their supervisors, sitting in offices overseas. The use of verifiable indicators in evaluation prevents the decision makers from coming to terms with the real issues (for an example of this, see Justice, 1986).

## Conclusion

Development as it has been attempted to date by secular organisations in the West cannot succeed. At best we can say, in faith, with Siame, 1991: "The enormous cost of relatively small increases in productivity does not mean that the cost was not justified." At worst, the West is succeeding in keeping the NWPZ with the rest of Zambia well and truly under its thumb, and ensuring that changes which could otherwise result in the empowering of the people do not occur, perhaps through fear that they would threaten peace and the superior position of the Western countries.

Goulet (1971) points out that development intervention must have recourse to ethics. He goes on to say "The simple fact that "modern" men are richer and more powerful than "traditional" men is no argument for the superiority of their values." Were that claim to be accepted, much of secular development activity would crash around our ears.

Being critical is generally considered to be relatively easy. I do however believe there is not only a negative, but also a positive message to be learned from the NWPZ, and it is to the more difficult task of communicating this that I now turn.

I will investigate in the next chapter how the Lagos Press in 1894 could say in Nigeria that "of all the agencies which have contributed to the regeneration and development of our country, missionary effort has been the most potent." Cited in Ayandele (1967). Does the same apply to the NWPZ?

## Notes

1. The tendency of education to draw people from their own communities into paid employment is well known. When this paid employment is seen as unproductive, it can be interpreted as resulting in a 'waste' of the education given. This is of course part of a much larger problem, but one aggravated by development organisations who are prepared to pay high rates for the best people.

2. An example of a futile activity encouraged supposedly for the common good, would be the financial incentive given

to people in Mwinilunga district by NORAD for the digging of fish ponds, none of which were maintained once the money had been received (Bentley, 1991).

3. There was a lot of effort put into training of the Zambian personnel on this project. Many were taken to Denmark for this purpose, (Kaposi, 1991) but the project nevertheless proved unsustainable.

4. Cultural conservatism is not something peculiar to the NWPZ, Africa, or the Third World. It is a universal human trait. I will just give a few examples to illustrate how someone in NWPZ may very likely see Westerners as 'culturally conservative'. These are my own thoughts, but based on discussions I have had with residents of NWPZ.

i. All the Westerners who come are always extremely busy. Poor people. Probably have no time in which to enjoy life. They don't seem to learn either. They get extremely frustrated, even unpopular, but the new ones are usually just as bad.

ii. (On the observation that Westerners in NWPZ are often especially prone to sickness). Western people seem to think that their medicine will cure diseases without recourse to witchcraft. We tell them that it is necessary to use magic in order to be healthy. They don't listen, and become sick extremely frequently as a result.

iii. Western children are terrors. We set an example as to how to rear children so that they are respectful and obedient, but they do not follow it. They suffer at the hands of their children, but even that does not convince them of the error of their ways. Even teaching them how to look after children would probably not convince them.

5. Different strengths of magic are recognised in Kaonde tradition (Melland, 1923). If magic fails to be effective, or if someone is seen to be using more powerful magic than the attacker is using, in their defence, this means that even more powerful magic must be used in return. In other words, if ones efforts in killing are frustrated by modern medicine (ie white mans magic), the response may be simply to use more powerful magic, and perhaps inflict a different type of injury.

6. I would suggest that the arrival at, and maintenance of the material view is not derived from any objective process of analysis. It is rather a necessary view given the course

of development of Western culture. The 'existence  
rationality' (see Chapter 3) of which is incompatible with  
a theory of development which has religion as a necessary  
component.

## Chapter 3. ENABLING PEOPLE TO OVERCOME CULTURAL CONSERVATISM

"[It is an] uphill task that confronts all who try to help the local Bantu to advance : one continually comes up against the wall called "Custom," which being considered divine is at present insurmountable." Melland, 1923.

### 3.1 An established view

An observer in any country of the world will find some people are materially better off than others. In England in the 16th century, there was evidence to find that puritan Christians were especially likely to be in the middle class (McClelland, 1976), suggesting that it was puritans who were the successful businessmen. On investigation in some parts of Zambia it has been found that the prosperous villages are often the ones which have adopted a Western Christian religion (Cross, 1992). This prompts the question as to why it is that the Christians may be more prosperous than their neighbours?

Norman Long's study in Serenje in Zambia (1968) is a well known example in this area. Long is careful to point out that "... we should be skeptical of formulations which posit a simple one to one relationship between religious affiliation and economic success". Nevertheless, he found that being a Jehovah's Witness made for "greater upward economic mobility". Long concluded that it was membership of the Watchtower sect that enabled the people to put aside some of their traditional obligations to kin and family, so that they could then accumulate wealth themselves. The benefits from their own labour were then such as to provide them with sufficient incentive to work hard. A similar relationship was also found among the Giarama of Kenya who adopted nominal Muslim beliefs, as recorded by Parkin in 1972.

Although this perception is helpful, I believe reality is rather more complex than it alone suggests. I will now try to investigate the effect of religious affiliation in NWPZ in more detail. Before doing so, I will summarize a few aspects of Weber's and Durkheim's sociology of religion which are especially helpful in such a more detailed analysis.

Weber and Durkheim on religion

Weber has written a great deal about the influence of religion on the development of a society. He sees it as particularly instrumental in three ways: (Warner, 1973).

First is the direct impact of religious prescription, for example the prohibition of usury by the Catholic Church. But, unless such prohibitions have powerful sanctions associated with them, they may not be very effective in practice.

Second is the role of religion in legitimating social and political institutions. An African example here would be the belief in the power of the spirits of ancestors in maintaining family solidarity.

Thirdly, and perhaps most powerfully in the writings of Weber, can be seen the way in which religious conviction has resulted in ideas, which have created world images which "... have like switchmen, determined the tracks along which action has been pushed by the dynamic of interest. 'From what' and 'for what' one wishes to be redeemed, and let us not forget, 'could be redeemed' depended upon ones image of the world." (Warner, 1973). Thus, religious convictions can determine the nature of decisions, even if this occurs subconsciously.

Durkheim proposed that all understanding and knowledge, in the pre-scientific age, derived from religion. The nature of the religion therefore determines the type of understanding which will result (Durkheim, 1972).

### 3.2 Enabling mechanisms

I am now going to make some suggestions utilising this theoretical background on how it is that the Christian gospel has enabled change amongst the people of NWPZ, comparing especially with secular attempts at the same.

a. Development by material intervention, or by value change  
Development intervention is generally concerned with the way people live, what they do, and the way improvement can be encouraged using outside assistance. Peoples actions determine their way of life. Actions depend on two things, namely the nature of the environment (physical and social) in which people find themselves, and the ideas about and understanding of the environment they have. For a person's

situation to change, either the environment, or the way the person responds to it must change.

It is the former that has most frequently been chosen by secular intervention. The environment is typically altered by a subsidy of some kind. This can be of formal education, managerial help, the price of a machine or of food, an agricultural input etc. The change in the environment resulting from the subsidy results in altered decision making. The problem with subsidy comes when it proves unsustainable. This has unfortunately been the rule in NWPZ, as demonstrated by the short term nature of the development projects, as described in Chapter 2. Given that the NWPZ is going to remain largely 'isolated', plus the effect of the cultural conservatism described in Chapter 2, a subsidy from outside cannot be expected to cover its costs. When the subsidy is removed, the system will return to an equilibrium, which in the absence of a permanent change in the environment, will be the same as before the intervention occurred.

That is, developments will not be sustained unless a change has occurred in people's values, or the way they respond to their environment. In other words, in order to be sustainable development needs to be oriented to the changing of values.

The next question must be how such value change can be brought about. It can of course occur by means of the environment. This is the case in the introduction of a popular new crop. Sugar beans were introduced into NWPZ some years ago. People have subsequently come to value them as a food, so their production is continued.

The above is however not a major value change. The components of cultural conservatism mentioned in Chapter 2 have not been touched. Major alterations in values come by change in religious belief (see Durkheim on religion, above). Thus major lasting change comes through religious conversion, and the worldview change that results. In this case the motor for change is internal to the person. No material dependency is created.

Thus the proselytizing of the Christian missionaries has resulted in more effective and lasting change than the material activity of other agents. The nature of the change is closer to the ideals of participatory development,

appropriate technology, bottom up development, empowerment etc., which are recognised also by many secular organisations as desirable, but are extremely difficult for them to achieve (1). It is in the area of participation that a number of respondents to the survey (Appendix C) saw the church as having a positive role, eg Ngalande, 1991: "Yes, churches have a very big role all over Zambia. The word of God ... brings groups of people together ... church groups grow crops ..."

In this chapter and the next, I will demonstrate that Christian conversion enables people to take a more objective view on their environment, and enables them to be able to consider many of the changes which other development agents would like to impose (at least according to their rhetoric), but are unable to in practice. (See note 2 below for an analysis of values based on their division into normative and significative categories.)

b. Enabling 'rationality' in thought and action The traditional religion found in NWPZ includes an ancestor cult (Melland, 1923). According to Bond, 1987, writing about the 'Yombe' speakers in Northern Zambia, "Belief in ancestors and witchcraft are two sides of the same ideological coin in that they propound the same values ...". Max Weber (Sayer, 1991) tells us that, in traditional societies there is a "deep repugnance to undertaking any change because supernatural evils are feared".

Amongst the people of NWPZ, good or bad luck is often ascribed to the providence of spiritual forces such as those of ancestors, or witchcraft. The former are appeased by correctly following rituals and traditions such as making libations for ancestors (as described elsewhere in Zambia by Holy, 1986). The latter by dealing with the witch. From a scientific perspective, the courses of action suggested by the diagnoses of the problems are of little or no value in instituting improvements.

An example, if many people become sick with malaria, a biological culprit (ie the mosquito) will not be sought, but instead perhaps a deviant in the community who has failed to comply with tradition will be identified and purged in some manner. These practices have not decreased in recent times:

This is in fact the crux of the whole matter. Missionaries all over Africa are teaching a religion which casts out fear, but economic and social changes have so shattered tribal institutions and moral codes that the result of white contact is in many cases an actual increase in the dread of witchcraft, and therefore in the whole incidence of magic throughout the group. (Richards, 1939).

Melland (1923) tells us that "Witchcraft is universally considered an abomination." Witchcraft remains a major issue today: "In the rural areas virtually all deaths are ascribed to witchcraft in which case the harm is incalculable." (Times of Zambia, 1989). Far from having been overcome in modern times, the practice of witchcraft is increased by economic and social change, ie 'development'. "Intellectual truth" according to Kluckhohn (1962), will not dispel it.

Witchcraft acts as a major impediment to improved production, as "Many fear to expand their operations, as others who get jealous may do them harm" (Berendson, 1991). It impedes developmental change. Bangwe, (1991), the Farming systems economist with the ARPT (Adaptive Research Planning Team) of the NWPADP (North West Province Area Development Project), acknowledged that "Witchcraft is important in agricultural development." He explained that it was responsible for discouraging many potentially progressive farmers, but also admitted that "these things are not well documented".

Cross, 1973 has described the enormous spread of the Watchtower movement throughout Southern Africa in colonial days. One of the reasons given for its success is that it 'scratched where it itched' in so far as it attended to the problem of witchcraft. Holistic development, as by ideological conversion to Christianity, also takes account of people's spiritual needs, and to that extent helps them to overcome it. Protestant Christianity can free people from these ties, as they are seen as being able to communicate directly with God, who gives protection from evil forces. It is this freedom to seek solutions in the natural world for Christians that contributes greatly to the development of scientific investigation, a rational legal system etc (Sayer, 1991).

The above represents a significant change in worldview. It does not happen overnight, but the change is clearly

occurring in the NWPZ. It is the Christians more than others who put their faith in biological medical services and understanding, and are less inclined to see the need to use the services of a witchdoctor. This reduction in the incidence of witchcraft is a vital component to economic and social development.

c. Value change enabling material change The promotion of the use of agricultural machinery is often seen as a basis for desirable change in rural Africa, in that it enables increases in farm output. The record for the maintenance and use of machinery is however unfortunately poor. This can be ascribed to poor accessibility of spare parts, lack of training etc, but is also related to a persons values and their perception of time.

The absence of a linear perception of time makes the learning of preventative machinery maintenance especially difficult. Maintenance is very often not seen as necessary until something has gone wrong with a machine, by which time it may be too late to rectify the problem, if for example it was inadequate oil in an engine, as a result of which the engine seizes up.

Some are likely to point out that technical education can ensure that good care is taken of machinery. I contend that this is only half the answer. A man may be educated, and may even ascribe to himself a highly linear view of time but knowing how to maintain a machine does not mean that he will maintain it. The question of why remains. Thinking of the Western situation, what is it that ensures that mechanics take special care to do their work well? In the West, a mechanic who does a bad job loses social esteem, and probably his job, because of the task and career orientation inherent in the society, and the widespread appreciation of the sort of aptitude required for good machinery maintenance. Values being different in NWPZ, the career orientation is not found as strongly in Africa as in the West (Leonard, 1987), esteem is not based so much on a mans ability, as on his family position. Most people have very little idea about the way machines work, the necessity for regular maintenance, and therefore the reason for problems. The excuse given by the mechanic will be easily accepted, his public esteem will not be lost, the machine will remain poorly maintained.

For development to result in a use of technology which is sustainable, and viable (ie not vastly expensive), value change must precede its introduction.

d. Breaking down of the ingroup and outgroup distinction  
The strength of people's affiliation to their 'own group', and the equivalent lack of affiliation to another group has often restricted the ability of communities to coordinate their activities and work together (Weber in Bendix, 1966). According to Weber, it has been the influence of Christianity that has broken down these barriers in the past.

The significance of this development for contemporary Zambia would be great. The affinity to family above 'office', and the fact that a member of the other group could be cheated without condemnation by the own group, is the basis of what is now often called 'corruption' in African society, this deriving from a system which Weber calls Patrimonialism (Bendix, 1966, Cross, 1992). Corruption is widely identified in NWPZ as a cause of many of the ills of society which perpetuate poverty (survey in Appendix C).

Equality in society, and power to the common man have also historically come through the church. Tocqueville, 1945, tells us that it was, in France, that "through the church, equality penetrated into the government, and he who as a serf must have vegetated in perpetual bondage took his place as a priest in the midst of nobles, and not infrequently above the heads of Kings." This process is occurring now in Zambia as the importance of family position is eroded, and social position can be based on other considerations.

The notion of equality of opportunity is not inherent in NWPZ society. It is found in the bible, "There is neither Jew nor Greek, slave nor free, male nor female, for you are all one in Christ Jesus." (Galations 3:28). It is this egalitarianism inherent in Christianity which was seen by the colonialists in Kenya as threatening their supremacy, so deterring them from employing Christians in the police force. Similarly "'Are your pupils taught that all men are equal?' was one of the anxious questions put to the Anglican Bishops by Kenya's first director of education in 1912." (Stanley, 1991).

## Notes

1. Community participation now forms part of the United Nations rhetoric, in its 'fight against world poverty' (Midgely, 1986). At the same time achieving community participation, especially if it is to be in all aspects of a project, eg planning and evaluation as well as implementation, is extremely difficult. According to Midgeley, 1986: "The concept of a small community as a cohesive and integrated entity fighting for justice against powerful external forces is inspired by the romanticism of populist thought rather than a serious analysis of community life and its complex characteristics and dynamics."

2. Goulet, 1971, writes about the existence of two types of value. One is normative, which indicates behaviour that should or should not occur. The other is significative, concerning the meaning of reality, linking "what ought to be done" with the "meaning of life and death".

Significative norms are determined by a people's 'existence rationality'. That is, the rationale they use to give reason and purpose to their existence. Asking them to alter their significative values is therefore not a simple matter of education, or an enlightened understanding, but rather an undermining of their existence rationality, and thereby the way in which they justify to themselves why they do what they do.

An example would be to suggest to a secular atheistic man that it is 'normal' for religion to be a key component of development. This will undermine his significative beliefs in the absence of God. Such a situation would therefore be rejected not only on normative grounds, but also significative, as it challenges the rationale for his existence, and thus also rejection would be based not on objective reason, but subjective evaluation.

Another example, in the NWPZ, is the reluctance of people to give children first priority over food (see Chapter 2). The altering of this norm requires a change in existence rationality. Giving children first choice over food is undermining the seniority ascribed to the old, and even the ancestors, to whom the old are the closest. The survival or health of the child is understood as being more dependent

on the goodwill of the ancestors than on the food it eats. It follows that depriving the old, who will soon be the ancestors, of food may be detrimental to the child, and also in fact to the community. This explains the frequent return of malnourished children to Mukinge hospital (in NWPZ), despite their mothers being told repeatedly that they need more and better feeding.

To permanently alter this situation requires the undermining of, or significant change in the nature of, the belief in the power of the spirits of ancestors. This is something that probably does not happen quickly, but acceptance of Christianity does, at least over the course of a number of generations, bring about this change. Thus, the means to reduce child malnutrition can be seen to be conversion to Christianity. The same applies to other aspects of behaviour.

## Chapter 4. A MEANS TO EMPOWERMENT

Having looked at the ways in which Christianity frees people from the ties of traditional culture, I will now examine more specifically some of the ways in which it 'empowers'.

4.1 Asceticism A peculiarity of protestant Christianity is it's doctrine of salvation by grace. This is seen by Weber as one of the key determinants of the rise of capitalism in the West (Sayer, 1991). Calvin was one of the major proponents of this doctrine. In his understanding of the scriptures, instead of having to work hard and be good enough to 'be saved', salvation became a gift. Weber then understood a work ethic to have developed as men sought to find assurance for their salvation. The end of life was to glorify God, and not to maximise pleasure and acquisition, even though people had been freed from many of the traditional obligations to family, appeasing of ancestors etc. What mattered was not just what one did, God could see to the heart, so it was also the spirit in which one did it; mundane activities which had for generations been seen as undesirable chores, took on religious significance. This willingness to produce, but then not immediately to consume, is given by Weber as enabling the accumulation of capital, which was instrumental in the industrial revolution.

The question then is whether protestant Christianity is still having the same effect in NWPZ? I certainly saw some of this myself in the school where I was working in NWPZ. The school staff had a reputation in the province for working hard and a teacher explained to me on one occasion that he did not work hard in order to please the headmaster, government or even his fellows, but to please God. Seventh Day Adventists have a reputation for being hard and reliable workers in Southern province, (Gluckman, cited in Long, 1968). The staff at Mukinge mission recognise that Christians are more hardworking and reliable than other local people.

Without the ability to accumulate, capitalism is not possible. Any attempts at introducing capitalism are bound to be unsustainable without outside intervention until this ability to 'save' has been acquired. The adoption of

Christianity in Zambia results in the development of a work ethic, and an attitude to wealth which is more amenable to accumulation of capital (1).

4.2 Enabling of rural growth linkages Economic growth in rural areas is often severely retarded by the tendency of wealth to leave the rural, and be invested in urban areas, or be used to buy goods of urban, or even overseas origin (Hart, 1988).

This tendency is not easy to counter, and has led to the failure of attempts at development from an agricultural base in many parts of the world. How then did poor rural people avoid this trap in developing Europe? Hall, 1959, gives a clue. He describes the Lollard movement as taking a strong hold in England, as a result of the biblical interpretation and writings of Wyclife. This is a form of protestantism, and its followers had the following characteristics:

Poor and hard working ... the Lollard adherent gave up all that marked the life of the prosperous class ... all that made life joyous to his oppressors was to him an evidence of sin, and lead to eternal damnation ... everything which the struggling dissenting class disliked in the conduct and mode of life in the ruling class was naturally found to be forbidden by the bible, ...

The outcome of such a sentiment can be imagined. These poor people, far from coveting the things of the wealthy, condemned them on spiritual grounds. Not being desirous of their goods or lifestyle the poor would not want to invest what little they had with the rich or become dependent on their usurious loans. The biblically derived value of the poor would have given them status over and above that of the rich in their own eyes.

The implications for the NWPZ are clear. Far from developing dependency on imported wealth, the aim could be to enable people to reject "all that made life joyous to [their] oppressors" (Hall, 1959) including the standards of any egoistic philanthropists who are trying to 'help' them. From this point, rural based development by backward and forward linkages to agriculture could occur.

There is evidence for this process already occurring. For example some Christians in NWPZ have higher moral standards

than many of the Western missionaries, for example in considering it inherently sinful and non-Christian to listen to secular as against Christian music, or to drink alcohol. It may be paternalistic efforts by missionaries at gently 'nurturing' the church that are preventing further change, which may be desirable, in this area?

4.3 Gender Weber observed male female relations amongst Christians, and saw Christians as having "played a part in the emancipation of women." (Weber cited in Sayer, 1991). Throughout the world it is those countries in the Judo/Christian religion in which women are found to be the most 'liberated'. Alternative religions almost invariably have strict controls on women, for example the exclusion of Muslim women, and the secondary status of women associated with Purdah in Hinduism.

The evidence for the way in which Christianity considers women to be especially valuable is overwhelming in NWPZ. It is the missions which have taken it upon themselves to educate women, when the colonial government, and even the National government since independence has been interested overwhelmingly in men (2). The debate on polygyny is an ongoing and complex one, but in part at least is concerned with the liberation of women. On my own observation, Christian couples can be seen relating closely to one another, whereas other marriage relationships appear to be primarily 'functional'. Women are especially likely to suffer if the husband is keen on drinking alcohol, while both the Brethren and ECZ churches in NWPZ condemn drinking for Christians.

An important point to be aware of here is the ambiguity of the term 'liberation'; liberation from what, for what? Without entering into debate in this area, it is perhaps adequate to say that among Christians women are seen as of equal value to men before God. In other words, I am taking the view that the fact that a woman has a different role in life than a man does not mean she is being either suppressed or exploited.

4.4 Literacy It is the fact that Christianity came into France to which Durkheim attributes the beginning of schools, which resulted in literacy, with all its widely recognised benefits. (Durkheim, 1977). The same can be said in NWPZ. It was the missionaries that began the schooling in the province (Wilkin, 1983). The primary motivation

behind the promotion of literacy was the desire to help people to read the bible. It is of course widely recognised that the ability to read is a major aid to development more broadly.

In Kaonde society, disputes have in the past been decided by oracle, revelation or ordeal (Melland, 1923). This demands very little 'calculative thought'. An 'interim' means, between this system and the 'rational legal' one found in the West requiring much 'calculation', is one guided by principles in the bible. This encourages detailed study, discussion of the nature of justice, and relatively complex thought processes, which are an education in themselves (3).

I have personal experience of listening to this process, of discussion of the relevance of biblical guidelines to contemporary life, amongst local people in the NWPZ, and would conclude that it allowed people to adopt new modes of thought in relation to issues of life, and also come closer to 'rational' thought processes. Having gone through this process, people were able to question the missionary who claimed to expound the bible if his version did not agree with their understanding, and in this sense they were empowered. A 'religion of the book' has distinct advantages in terms of development.

4.5 Countervailing power Many countries in Sub Saharan Africa, Zambia included, are subject to authoritarian governments to various degrees. The viability of multi party systems, and their effectiveness at preventing dictatorial types of leadership have still to be proven. In the meantime, there is much evidence to show that it is the church that has often been the countervailing power, that has kept the government in check.

This role was originally one taken on by missionaries, such as described in Angola (neighbouring NWPZ) by Wilkin, 1983: "... foreign missionaries agitated against horrendous abuses upon Africans through forced labour ... local officials tried to handicap the criticisers as much as to correct the abuses." According to Gitari, 1986, a bishop in Kenya, it was the stand taken by the churches in Zambia which deterred the government from introducing scientific socialism. Gitari tells us that the church "must at all times take the side of the poor...". He clearly sees it as his role to use his position in the church to counter

government action when it is contrary to Christian principles. According to Hastings, 1979: "... the churches [in Africa] ... are politically strong - not in immediate action, but in resilience, in the confidence of many people, in their potentiality to carry out significant social programmes of medium size."

4.6 Political issue Academics recognise that underdevelopment and poverty are a consequence of power structures. It is said that in Africa there is a very powerful 'dominance of the political' (Geschiere, 1985). The fact that development resources tend to either leak to, or be captured by, elites, is well known. Political change is thus an important part of development and from this perspective materially oriented development initiatives are missing the point entirely.

The international development community is now increasingly emphasising the conditionality of political pluralism for receipt of ongoing aid support, although the process of enforcing political change in this way is a very cumbersome, largely unproven, and extremely 'paternalistic' one (Cross, 1992). NGOs sometimes become politically active, but this is a risky activity as a 'guest' in a foreign country.

To be effective in instituting change one nevertheless has to have a political impact. In addition to the role of the church as a countervailing power it has had a major effect on the Zambian government itself. Kaunda is the son of a Christian pastor, and often referred to the bible and Christian principles in his leadership. The nation's leaders have in the past been mission educated, and many remain in this category. The current president, Frederick Chiluba, also a Christian, is likely to be guided by his Christian principles.

4.7 Building self esteem Whether inadvertently or consciously, development activity among its other social effects is creating new role models, and new bases for esteem. Goulet (1971) tells us that "As long as esteem or respect was dispensed on grounds other than material achievement, it was possible to resign oneself to poverty without feeling disdained."

Unfortunately, one effect very often of attempts at material development, is that esteem begins to be measured

on the basis of material welfare. This means that the poor are made to feel 'disdained', and also in so far as this new orientation is adopted, ambitious young men aim to gain prestige not by traditional means, which include mechanisms to ensure family responsibilities were not neglected etc, but by accumulating material by whatever means are available (Crehan, 1986). This has many damaging effects, on traditional family life (4).

This kind of value system, if adopted, can have very serious repercussions on the whole of society. The key to avoiding this is to ensure that, as far as possible, progress is not primarily associated with material prosperity. This is something secular workers have great difficulty doing, as material wealth is the very thing they are promoting. In Christianity on the other hand, esteem is dependent on moral behaviour and not material accumulation. This point is made by Burrige, 1972, regarding the concept of 'manhood' among the Tangu speaking people, he says that "Only with the moral European (ie missionary) do the possibilities of manhood become realizable."

I found the same thing myself. My standing, among fellow Christian teachers in Zambia, did not derive from my wealth, educational achievements, or skill (or otherwise) at teaching. It derived from their perception of myself as a moral human being, standing before God. As such I was not superior, so may it continue.

4.8 A basis for ethics Immanuel Kant is the philosopher renowned for the 'categorical imperative': "Always act in such a way that you can also claim that the maxim of your action should become a universal law." (Kant, 1981). This is a principle I would like to suggest he borrowed from Christianity. He himself quotes from the bible in the 'Grounding', and the principle he is working on was expounded 1700 years earlier in the New Testament; "In everything, do to others what you would have them do unto you, for this sums up the law and the prophets." (Gospel of Matthew 7:12).

The writings of Kant reveal what a powerful guideline the above is. Kant believed that all morals could be derived from it. This is refuted by others, eg Weber, 1978, but the principle remains extremely useful. This principle, when picked up through a knowledge of the bible, is operational also in NWPZ society. Masua, 1991, explained how in

traditional society, it was not considered to be wrong to lie, as long as one was not found out. The principle which Kant calls the 'categorical imperative' can be called upon to explain why lying is intrinsically wrong. Otherwise, 'development' is likely to be severely hindered by the unrestrained telling of lies.

4.9 Direct prescription I have intentionally left this section until last, as it appears to be widely considered that direct prescription by religious teachers is not very effective at instituting change (see Chapter 3).

One important problem being faced at the moment in the NWPZ is the widespread incidence of Aids. The church advocates that sexual intercourse be confined to within marriage, and that one partner should be kept for life. Such practices, if adopted, will clearly protect people from aids.

Direct prescriptions deal with other areas of morality. Tulopa (1991), a farmer near Kasempa, was able to tell me that: "Church goers are good. They do not drink, dance or smoke. They avoid fighting."

#### Notes

1. I say here carefully that Christians are more amenable to the accumulation of capital. Christians in Zambia do not automatically become capitalists. There remains a strong social stigma associated with those who accumulate rather than sharing what they have with relatives and friends.

2. Mukinge Girls Secondary School (MGSS) was built by the AEF in the early 1960s. This was intended to help redress the balance, where up until that time secondary education in the province was only available to boys.

3. The term 'calculation' is used here in the Weberian sense. eg where calculation is the key component which makes modern capitalism, as known in the West, different from 'booty capitalism'.

4. Prestige for men in traditional Kaonde society, as described by Crehan, 1986, is achieved by being a headman over a large group of relatives. People are free to move between villages, and choose from a number of possible headmen they would like to be under. This means, that in

order to attract a lot of people to his village and thus be prestigious, a man must have a reputation for good governance, ie he must be oriented to serving the people in whatever is the culturally acceptable way. This system is being disrupted by the possibility of entering into production of crops for sale. Money begins to be the measure of success and prestige, so that relatives become less important. Those most likely to lose out are the women, children, old and weak.

## Chapter 5. A CRITICAL EXAMINATION OF THE DEVELOPMENT ROLE OF MISSIONARIES AND THE AFRICAN CHURCH

### Introduction

Missionaries have been heavily criticised over the years for their work in Africa. I would like to suggest that the criticism can fall into three camps.

Firstly, normative, by those with a conflicting view of the 'good life'. As Williams, 1988 tells us, "What is true cannot be answered separately from the question; what ought we to do?" It is no wonder then that those with a different understanding of truth than the missionaries should criticise them. "Underlying a viable theory of ideology is a vision of the good life." Much of the content of a criticism, and defence of missionary activity in Africa must of necessity be based on differing normative assumptions on the nature of the 'good life'.

Secondly, many of the critiques made of missionary activity in Africa are based on misunderstandings of means and ends. In other words, modern man has such a powerful material view of life, that he can see no other course to development than a material one, despite historical and other evidence to the importance of religious and ideological fervour in the course of change, ie development (eg Weber, in Bendix, 1966, Durkheim, 1972, Hall, 1959, McClelland, 1976). In other words, I suggest that criticism in this area is misdirected by those who see 'development' as the objective, although it may be valid for those who say people have no moral right to interfere with the way others live.

Finally, there is also the question of the desirability of taking Western culture along with the gospel. This has been directed in different ways at different times, ie sometimes missionaries have been criticised for not sharing the benefits of Western culture, and at other times they have been castigated for corrupting indigenous cultures with Western culture (1). It is not easy to answer critics who contradict one another.

The above refers mainly to criticism from Europe. Ironically perhaps, much of the criticism coming from

Africa does not condemn missionaries for their carrying the gospel, but is levelled against the western culture they bring with it, including even customs of the Western churches. A good example is Amu, cited in Adjei 1944: "... I must admit Christianity is the best and only religion worth having. But I do not mean Christianity as I see it in Europe, but Christianity according to Jesus Christ..."

5.1 Advocating Western customs Early missionaries are often castigated for their role of shoring up the Colonial establishment (see Ayandele, 1967). Such did however often appear justifiable at the time, for example Livingstone, (1857) advocated trade out of concern for the people, not seeing the need to question that the development of commerce was in their interest.

Critics who accuse missionaries of forcing 'Africans' to wear European clothing perhaps have not realised that they often themselves have a great liking for clothes. "It must be remembered that cloth was always thought valuable in this area [Northern Province of Zambia] since its first appearance in the hands of Arab traders in the middle of the 19th Century. ... clothes are a source of excitement and delight..." (Richards, 1939). Most missionaries would not have discouraged the wearing of clothes, as to have done so would have been flying in the face of popular demand, and even leaving people in a demeaning position were a Westerner to come and scorn their nakedness.

Such issues of 'modernisation' remain pertinent today. Just to give an example, one can take the teaching of school pupils to use a knife and fork to eat with. This was the regular practice at MGSS (Mukinge Girls Secondary School in NWPZ) for many years. Many would criticize this, as teaching the pupils to use equipment which they are unlikely ever to use again. On the other hand, it is likely that, should a girl find herself eating with European company at some stage in her later life, her inability to use a knife and fork, may be laughed at. Unfortunately or otherwise, appearance and manners are important in being accepted by people of a particular culture. It is valuable for people to have an understanding of what are in fact international cultural norms, in our modern world of the 'global village'.

5.2 Paternalism This has been a characteristic ascribed both to colonialists, and missionaries working in Africa.

It appears to be derived from a perception of inherent cultural superiority by Europeans over Africans. This kind of perception needs to be actively countered, by a broader understanding of what is good and what is valuable than that typically held.

Paternalism, I suggest, is more likely with the scientifically, or technically oriented European. This is typically expressed in task orientation. For example, hospitals, being complex Western institutions, tend to be more dependent on Western values for their 'efficient' operation, so more paternalism is likely to be found in a hospital environment than one for example of a primary school.

Paternalism can also be derived from the comparative wealth of the missionary. People in NWPZ desire material goods, and in their own culture do not hesitate to ask for things from 'friends'. A missionary is in a complex trap here. If a national asks for something, and it is denied him or her, and it is clear from the missionaries obvious wealth that denial is a conscious decision and not due to the inability to provide, this can be followed by accusations of paternalism. If, on the other hand, the missionary gives in, and makes it his/her business to satisfy the expressed needs of the people, he/she meets a whole host of difficulties. Which people? Which expressed needs? To support the traditional hierarchy (which may be seen by many as repressive), or to undermine it? To sell the item requested or give it away? If to sell it, at a subsidised price (undercutting the local businessman), or at a profit, but then is it the role of the missionary to be trading, and profiteering, especially as traditional culture does not look approvingly on those who aim to make money? Once something has been handed over, especially if subsidised, does the missionary not have a moral responsibility (to the donors?) to ensure it is used in the way intended, eg that a vehicle is not allowed to breakdown within a month due to inadequate maintenance? Such a responsibility can only be exercised with a degree of 'paternalism'. There are clearly many difficult problems due to misunderstandings resulting from differences in culture and wealth.

There are in fact only two clear courses of action for the missionaries. The first, and most desirable but in practice very difficult, is to put aside their wealth and 'live as the natives do'. The other option is to be selective in

meeting peoples needs, in other words, on some basis to decide which are the priorities, and to this extent to be paternalistic.

5.3 The origin of development ethics This begs the question of the nature of the non-material help required. I would like to suggest from a biblical perspective that the emphasis on material aid to the poor of another culture is not as strong as it is sometimes made out to be (See Appendix B). This is consequential not only for practising Christians, but also those secular development agencies whose activities are founded on Christian principles.

Material aid across cultural barriers is likely to result in misunderstanding. For example, it is not natural for people to expect a stranger to arrive out of the blue, with no other motive than to 'help' them. He will be viewed suspiciously. In addition, an individual who benefitted from the benevolence of such a stranger may well become the subject of jealousy, and associated social stigma. (See also section on paternalism above.)

A massive industry of 'development' has been built on the foundations of the ethic that there is a moral obligation to help the poor of a different culture. It is an industry fraught with problems and internal contradictions, and with a very poor success record. Part of the reason becomes clear, as on examination even the foundation on which it is based is found to be uncertain. Unfortunately, there are so many vested interests in this very industry, that it is likely to survive, not on merit, but on account of the lies those vested interests are able to propagate to those ignorant on such matters which form the voting or contributing population in the donor countries. This is partly a reflection of the hegemony of understanding of materialism over the entire Western culture.

If material assistance has proved so damaging, it could be asked why it continues to be accepted? There are various reasons for this, the major one I would suggest being political (see Chapter 2). Material assistance often comes with little or no short term cost. Not only does that make it an attractive proposition for local leaders; they cannot refuse it (2).

On the other hand, the gospel is likely to be accepted or rejected on merit, and if accepted will be such as the person will be committed to 'making it work'.

5.4 Inadequate training for cross cultural work One way of approaching the above difficulties is to try and improve the training in cross cultural understanding of development workers. This is clearly desirable. In many cases, I would suggest, the training given is not radical enough, as the basic Western values remain unchallenged.

Lessons of experience however reveal that some things can only be learned by experience. Goulet 1971, talks about the 'shock of underdevelopment'. He says underdevelopment is 'more of a mystery than a problem, and that if we stand back and examine it, we will misunderstand it'. What is required is that the one who intends to work in the Third World; "must make the dramatic discovery that there exists an inherent structural paternalism between him as 'developed' and the other as 'underdeveloped' " and "Since most people engaged in development work have not experienced this shock, they remain ill prepared to understand underdevelopment at its deepest level and to devise appropriate policies for eliminating it." The nature of training needed is a 'shock', resulting from exposure to the 'underdeveloped'. This shock can be allowed to occur by encouraging new cross cultural workers (missionary or secular) to:

1. Learn the local language.
2. Work under a national of the country of service.
3. Be given little responsibility or resources, at least in the first term of service.
4. Allow their values to be critically questioned.

Cross-cultural misunderstandings will clearly continue. They must be minimised by extended exposure, with much patience on both sides. The one who is of most value as a result of this exposure is the long term worker committed to people, and not the short term worker committed to a project.

5.5 Effect on the indigenous culture Another fault often ascribed to missionaries, is that they destroy indigenous culture. This accusation is perhaps made less forcefully now than in the past, as there is more widespread understanding that cultures are not static, but anyway always changing. A missionary should not deny that cultural

change is a primary objective, that is after all the inevitable outcome of a radical change in belief. A number of points can be made about the nature of cultural change, and the way it is implemented.

Anyone moving from one culture to another, inevitably takes values from their own culture with them. The 'development worker' who aims to help people without changing people's culture, is only fooling himself. Technology is not culturally neutral. A simple example to explain this, can be found in Holy, 1986. The introduction of the plough among the Toka speaking people of Zambia meant that cultivation became a team and not an individual activity, as was cultivation by hoe. A man thus had to seek assistance in order to cultivate his fields, and he very often sought this from his son. Unfortunately, a close relationship between father and son is not compatible with the matrilineal system of inheritance previously found amongst the Toka. The matrilineal system was being undermined, and such a technological innovation thus had profound implications for the whole society.

This is the sort of change that could, perhaps, equally have been introduced by either the missionary or the secular worker. The strong current of opinion in the West however, that technology is culturally neutral, means that innovations such as the above are likely to be implemented blindly, without consideration for the wider social ramifications, by secular workers. The defence of the missionary would be in so far as he/she had a more holistic view of development and change. Such a view is not found universally among missionaries, but arguably more so than amongst secular workers.

5.6 Counter economic effects There is a danger in assuming that the church in Africa is a replica of its European predecessors. In practice many of its characteristics differ, through 'syncretism' with the pre-existing culture. This becomes especially clear in the case of the AICs (Africa Independent Churches) such as those described in Sundkler, 1961, but is also apparent in a 'mission church' such as the ECZ.

Turner, 1980 admits that some of these syncretistic characteristics are economically "dysfunctional". These include the practice of some groups to reject Western medicine, deprive important political groups of support,

give some irrational prophetic instructions, such as 'never travel on Tuesdays', etc. Occasionally, a sect builds up, such as a branch of the Watchtower movement which at one time would drown people it was baptising if they were found to be witches (Cross, 1973) or one such as the Lumpa sect of Northern Province of Zambia, which resulted in 700 people being killed (Barret, 1968). A typical practice in the ECZ which is not widely found in the Western churches of the missionaries, is all night prayer meetings. Nevertheless, Turner concludes that "the overall effect across the independent churches is very much on the credit side of the development ledger".

#### 5.7 People commitment and not poverty commitment

Conventional development strategies often operate policies oriented specifically to the poor (eg Williams, 1990). There is an inherent problem here, in that they are self defeating. In other words, if a poor family is helped, so that it is no longer poor, then it is no longer deserving, and no longer helped. The withdrawal, or threat of withdrawal of help, can have a number of undesirable effects such as:

- i. The lack of continuing support will result in the return to the previous underdeveloped state.
- ii. The family will either hide the signs of development, or even consciously avoid 'developing', so as to continue to benefit from what is offered.

The way to avoid these difficulties is to be less 'poverty' and more 'people' oriented. A commitment to development intervention should be an ongoing one to a group of people and not dependent on ongoing poverty. In addition to avoiding the above problems, this has the additional advantages of increasing understanding, language learning, and the building of relationships over time.

This has clear disadvantages for a secular agency dependent for its funding on being seen to be 'helping the poor', (or even 'very poorest'). In fact, financial commitment from the donors to the poor is very often only of short term duration. It falls off when a crisis being attended to moves from the centre of media attention, (Nicholds, 1992), or when it becomes apparent that the intervention is proving unsustainable. This means projects generally need to operate on a short term horizon only.

Again the operations of missionaries are quite different (3). The command being acted upon is 'go and make disciples of all nations' (Gospel of Matthew, 28:19), so the commitment is, theoretically at least, ongoing. In practice, this is clearly seen by the continued presence of missionaries in NWPZ, many of whom have been there for 15, 20 or even more years. Missionaries of the CMML and AEF have been in the province since the beginning of the century (see Chapter 1).

This does not mean that the church does not help the poor or weak. Looking around in the UK, it becomes clear very often that it is the old, weak, children and often women that are most often found in a church building. The same applies elsewhere. These are the very people being targeted by many development agencies. As McClelland, 1976, tells us "Such ideological movements ... provide an important source of emotional security for people who are rendered rootless and unhappy by the disruption of traditional ways of doing things."

5.8 A valid critique? Beidelman, 1982, is an example of an author who does not hesitate to be critical, in this case of an evangelical mission in Tanganyika (now Tanzania). He says that "The stereotypes which the missionaries held derived from a muddled view that both over and underestimated the capacities of Africans." and "What the CMS (Church Missionary Society) resented most was not the loss of independence but their realisation that the religious beliefs that they had promoted did not correspond to the realities around them." Yet, at the end of the book he concedes that "the post colonial government is found to be no better." Beidelman has failed to understand the constraints within which the missionaries were working. According to his understanding of justice they have been found wanting, yet their successors have been found no better; rather perhaps even worse.

## Conclusion

Much criticism has been levelled at missionaries working in Africa, and in the NWPZ, and there are areas where this is justified. The nature of the criticism clearly depends on the criterion used by the critic. It has very often been based on Western values, has been internally inconsistent

over time and between different critics. Critics from Africa have a different view again.

Recent developments among missionaries are however more worrying. Age old ideas are being discarded in favour of fashionable materialistic approaches learned from the West, in apparent ignorance of their wider ramifications. The message to the missionary societies must be to continue to consider the way their working is to be guided by the bible. A weakness ascribed to missionaries in the past by Stanley, 1990, is probably as valid today as it has ever been: "Their vision was frequently clouded by national and racial pride, and in certain essential respects was distorted by the mechanistic world view which they had inherited from enlightenment thought".

Missionaries will remain liable to criticism. A valid question however is to the nature of the counterfactual; what may the situation have been in Africa if it had not been for the influence of Christianity in Europe, and then if missionaries had not accompanied the colonialists? What difference would be made if missionaries were now to curtail their activities? Further discussion on these questions unfortunately goes beyond the bounds of this study.

## Notes

1. Melland, 1920, was a strong critic of the AEF (then the SAGM). He accused them of not putting sufficient effort into the development of secular education in NWPZ. Others have been critical of missionaries for their linking of secular education with their evangelistic work, on the basis that it does yet more damage to the culture (Stanley, 1991).

2. A leader who refuses an offer of help or assistance to those for whom he is responsible runs the risk of losing popularity. The people are going to assume that the assistance would have been in their interests, and will lay the blame on him if they appear to be suffering in any way through failure to accept what was offered. For political

reasons therefore, it is very difficult to refuse. In the situation in the NWPZ, it is in addition likely that the person making the offer is able to justify it on instrumentally rational grounds. Its rejection would probably be more complex to justify, on the basis of a less 'sophisticated' form of reasoning.

3. There may appear to be a contradiction here. I have said that Christians are oriented to the poor and that this is good, but then have gone on to say that the strong orientation to the poor by secular development organisations is counter-productive. The reason for this apparent discrepancy is the different nature of the action on the part of the poor. The Christian approach to the poor, is ideally to disciple them, 'empower' them and have an ongoing commitment to their spiritual growth, which does not have the immediate effect of lifting them out of poverty, but rather of helping them to live with it. On the other hand, secular development organisations with their material aid, will most likely lift the people out of their immediate crisis, so that an evaluation done will indicate that the poverty has been 'removed', and help is no longer needed. The intervention will most probably not have rectified the problem of poverty in the long term.

## SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

The Christian gospel is enabling people in NWPZ to find an identity and worth so that they can consider their own lives and future free from many of the fetters of tradition that had previously bound them. Attempts at development by secular organisations are likely to empower a few, but impoverish or have no impact on the majority.

Even from a perspective which says they are of not of absolute worth, the values required for development to occur are those deriving from Christianity. Adoption of Christianity will not necessarily result in development on Western lines, but failure to adopt Christian values removes even that possibility.

Two aspects of the nature of the approach of missionaries make them particularly effective in development by comparison with secular development workers. One is the greater ongoing commitment of missionaries to a particular people, work or region. Secondly, their work is oriented to changing peoples worldview, so that material changes come from inside them, rather than being imposed upon them.

It was often the missionaries who prevented the exploitation of the people of Africa in colonial times. Later mission education and conversion of nationals to Christianity were important in the independence movements that spread throughout the continent, including Zambia. Today, the Christian church very often remains the major countervailing power to government.

At the same time, missionaries and the church in NWPZ do not claim to be faultless. This thesis has found that criticism is due particularly where they have adopted Western ways which are not explicitly Christian, and often culturally inappropriate.

If the message of this thesis is to be taken seriously, and in so far as NWPZ is typical of the developing world in general, major changes are needed in the way 'development' is perceived. These changes do not at the moment appear very feasible, but I would nevertheless like to spell them out for the benefit of readers.

The West still yields much power over the world, so this is where change can have a widespread impact. The hegemony of materialism narrows peoples thinking. The teaching of religion, ethics and philosophy in schools therefore needs to be given greater emphasis. The monopoly of evolutionary and historical materialist teaching should be removed from the classroom, media etc. This can enhance appreciation of values in other cultures. This is an area where NGOs, and especially churches, can take a lead.

Attempts at directing the course of development by technological or financial intervention are very often counter-productive. Development organisations should consider more carefully their impact on the Third World. This means moving away from the emphasis on quantifiable evaluation, attempts at always reaching 'the poorest', the over reliance on money and technology as a means of change, the use of simplistic economic models to determine policy, or the dictation of on the field policy by the requirements of donors. They need to carefully consider their wider social impact in moral, ethical and religious as well as material terms. In practice this means that development intervention as practiced by secular organisations should cease.

The people of NWPZ need to free themselves from the exploitative trap being built around them. Loans, and even grants and gifts from the West, should be accepted only extremely cautiously. Instead of aiming at what is desirable in some utopian way, feasibility needs to be more closely examined. In reality, the West is in a rut, and unlikely to change. It is from the NWPZ, and perhaps the Third World in general, that the changes must come.

Leaders cannot implement changes without support from the people, it is they who need to be able to put aside their love of money and the things it can buy, which has enslaved them anew to the Western world, and rediscover values in other than the material. Realistically, this cannot occur without ideological change. The NWPZ churches have the potential to be motors for change. They should also seek to overcome their dependency on Western materials, and instead work in the interests of the people on the basis of New Testament guidelines. Partnership with expatriate workers can then be as equals.

It looks as if the NWPZ will continue to become materially poorer in the foreseeable future. The house that was there was built on sand. The hope for the future lies not in 'development intervention', it lies in the people themselves. In their ability to overcome witchcraft, to take pride in themselves independently of material affluence, to lay firm foundations on the 'rock' of belief, and not on the sand of the whim of the 'expert'.

## APPENDICES

### APPENDIX A

#### FURTHER DETAILS ON PROJECTS SEEN TO FAIL (See Chapter 2)

Much of the argument in this thesis rests on the observation that failure is the norm following 'development' projects in the NWPZ. I have given some examples to illustrate this in Chapter 2. At the same time I accept that the evaluation I have carried out is subjective.

Identifying failure is especially difficult because:

1. The definition of failure is dependent on the criteria used in evaluation.
2. Failures do not become widely reported, so are difficult to research.
3. It is normal to use 'escape hatches', ie excuses, to avoid the blame for failure, rather than to question the fundamental nature of the intervention that has failed (Clay and Schaffer, 1984).
4. To call something a failure is to challenge long established and powerful interests. It is not my intention to be confrontational, which is why I have only given brief details of the projects I came across in Chapter 2.

The information I do have, both of a factual nature, and interpreted in the light of my understanding of the people involved, is however more than adequate to convince me that the use of the term failure is justified. I believe another person who followed the same course of investigation, without vested interests in the continuation of the projects, would draw the same conclusion. Also, that if the actual impact of the projects was known to those providing the funds in the donor countries, that they would cease to support the organisations involved.

It was clear to me that I was able to get information and see things in a way which any visiting 'experts' would have been barred from doing. I would very often visit 'project sites' unannounced and (honestly) justify my inquisitiveness in my capacity as a teacher of agriculture wanting relevant information on local farming practice and innovations.

## APPENDIX B

### THE BIBLICAL VIEW ON HELPING THE POOR

Is there a biblical directive to be concerned for those who are poor? Is it not a Christian prerogative to go into the Third World and assist those who are suffering?

Yes it is. But, I would like to suggest that there are three widely held misconceptions that lead to a misunderstanding of the nature of the help required.

1. It is the over-riding material orientation of the Western culture, that has resulted in an interpretation of many biblical directives in material terms, when this is not the way they were originally intended, and with good reason. In other words, passages in the New Testament referring to evangelism among the poor are interpreted as advocating material aid to the poor.

An example of this is found in Galations 2:10 (in the bible). Paul says that "All they asked was that we should continue to remember the poor, the very thing I was eager to do." Although this passage is often interpreted as advocating aid for the poor, reading the previous verses, it becomes clear that the instruction is to remember the poor in the preaching of the gospel.

2. The context in which biblical commands were given has to be remembered as being one in which people had previously been largely unconcerned with those outside of their own family, clan, nation etc. The requirement to be sufficiently concerned for those outside this group to preach the gospel to them is itself revolutionary. The requirement for the provision of material help generally refers to people in ones own group / culture.

This is clearly illustrated by Peters reluctance to associate with gentiles, in the book of Acts, chapter 10.

3. Secular man has been overawed by the material achievements of Western culture. A theory of development

often called 'historical materialism' has been popularised by Karl Marx (Hook, 1955). This asserts that consciousness is determined by material position in society and not by religion, and that religion in itself has little impact on the material or other development of society. It is on this basis that it is thought that giving people material goods will enable them to overcome their difficulties. This view however ignores the persistence of cultural traits, the pervasive influence of belief systems on peoples lives, and clearly does not follow from the bible.

The New Testament is concerned primarily with the heart of man, and his relationship to God; it should therefore be used extremely cautiously in justifying material aid to the poor in the Third World.

Immanuel Kant (1981) based his writings on the categorical imperative: "Always act in such a way that you can also claim that the maxim of your action should become a universal law." This is very similar to saying, 'do to others what you would have them do unto you'. It is generally a very good guide for action, but breaks down when peoples needs differ due to them being of different cultures. It is perhaps by taking this maxim too far, that Western people who see people in other parts of the world in what they perceive to be difficult conditions, and consider it appropriate to respond in the way they would like to experience if they faced that particular plight without taking cultural differences into account.

## APPENDIX C

### SURVEY

The details below are of people whom I interviewed in the course of doing research in the first half of 1991, to try and determine local views on what would be the most appropriate way forward for the development of NWPZ. This was a qualitative survey, so I will not attempt to draw any quantitative results from it. Any conclusions drawn from it are sensitive, and subjective.

details not available

Key

Age: These are estimates as to the interviewees ages.

- A - under 25
- B - 26 to 35
- C - 36 to 50
- D - Over 50

Occupation

- Agric. - Agriculturalist
- Ext. - Extension / community work
- Econ. - Economist
- Women - Works with women
- Admin. - Administrator
- Retail - Shop owner

Years in Zambia

- L - Life
- No - Number of years

Employer

- GRZ - Government of the Republic of Zambia

What this survey did emphasise, in my view, is the complex nature of underdevelopment in NWPZ, and the fact that solutions required were not merely technical. The following are, according to my own subjective evaluation, the main areas of difficulty identified in the survey as hindering development:

1. Drunkenness / idleness
2. Jealousy (discouraging competition and progress).
3. Witchcraft
4. Poor marketing and supplies for agriculture
5. Corruption
6. Poor education

## Appendix D

### DISCUSSION OF SOME THEORETICAL ISSUES ASSOCIATED WITH THE VIEW THAT CHRISTIANITY IS ITSELF THE DEVELOPING AGENT IN THE NWPZ

The view of Christianity as the agent of 'civilisation' is not a new one (Stanley, 1990). It does however appear to have become less popular in recent times. I have made the comments below to try and avoid misunderstandings regarding this position.

The key part Christianity has played in the development of the West appears contradictory. Christianity, with its contempt for "joys of the world" (Durkheim, 1972), and emphasis on things of the sacred, nevertheless has resulted in the development of a culture which has achieved unequalled material success, and in which things of the 'profane' come to dominate. I am not going to examine this apparent paradox in any greater detail in this thesis.

If it is true, and most historians accept this, that Christianity played a key role in the development of Western society as it is now, (1) it can be deduced that many of the values the West holds derive from Christian teaching. It is therefore not surprising that the same values are found again in other cultures which are following the same course, or are guided by the same belief system. Similarly, those countries developing on a basis other than Christianity will be doing so on the basis of values unacceptable to the West.

An example of how economic development could occur, apparently in the absence of major Christian input is found in Japan. My point here is that it does not, as a result, fit Western values. For example, the Japanese work ethic, based on service to an Emperor to whom supernatural qualities are ascribed, is not one acceptable to the 'enlightened' West. Therefore, a Westerner involved in the development of Japan would have had great difficulty in promoting development along such lines. Similarly it can be surmised that putting decision making power in the hands of

Western experts in the development process would have hindered the rate of economic progress.

This position is clearly a very difficult one to promote in a country such as the UK, and generally the Western world, because of the dominant materialist and liberal philosophy which denies the importance of any one religion by asserting that all are equally valuable, that none should be promoted above another, and that those who take a contrary view are the divisive members of society. (This view is being challenged by recent literature (2)). This is not one based on 'truth' or 'rationality', but a particular kind of dogma. The origin of this dogma can be understood in different ways; it can be seen as pragmatically trying to keep the peace. Alternatively, it may be allowing people as far as possible to avoid having to ask some fundamental questions about life, the answers to which are difficult to find, and potentially 'disturbing' such as "why am I here?" and "what happens when I die?" From yet another perspective it can be seen as a means of trying to deny others the material benefits which are now enjoyed in the West.

It is in my attempt to be objective and rational that I am going to ignore the above dogma. Similarly, I am not going to take account of what in the West would be called 'supernatural intervention', not because I do not believe it is either significant or true, but so as to concentrate on explaining the efficacy of Christianity in sociological terms, based on the understanding given to modern sociology particularly by Max Weber, Emile Durkheim and others, in addition to personal experience, case studies in NWPZ and reference to other literature.

What I certainly do not want to be understood to be saying here is that adoption of Christianity necessarily results in material well-being, or that these features are inherently desirable to Christians. Rather, that the promotion of a Christian religion is a necessary prerequisite to development along lines which would be considered desirable from a Western value perspective.

#### Notes

1. Durkheim ascribes the introduction of education into France, and its subsequent development, almost entirely to the Christian church, in this case primarily Catholic.

Christians from Rome, were concerned for the souls of the French peasantry. They went to evangelise them. (They were accepted in France because of their orientation and concern for the poor.) In order for the French Priests to be able to read the bible, they needed to be taught literacy skills. This basic teaching could not be done without combining also instruction in the classics. Without Christianity, education, and the developments that resulted, would not have occurred in France.

2. Almond, 1990, is critical of rational choice theory, which sees all social actions as being oriented to self interest, with the following terms: "This failure of rational choice theorists ... leaves them with theories that cannot travel very far in space and time, and cannot deal effectively with political change."

## REFERENCES

- Adjei A 1944 'Imperialism and spiritual freedom : an African view' American journal of sociology 50 (3) : 189 - 198
- Almond GA 1990 A discipline divided Schools and sects in political science London: Sage publications
- Anderson A 1991 Interview Anderson worked as an agriculturalist for NORAD up to 1991
- Aristotle 1976 The ethics of Aristotle. The Nichomachean ethics. (trans Thomson JAK) Revised Tredennick H : Penguin books
- Ayandele EA 1967 The missionary impact on modern Nigeria 1842 - 1914 A political and social analysis USA: Humanities Press
- Bangwe L 1991 Interview Bangwe is the farming systems economist with the ARPT (Adaptive Research Planning Team) of the NWPZ
- Barrett DB 1968 Schism and renewal in Africa. An analysis of six thousand contemporary religious movements Lusaka: Oxford University Press
- Beidelman TO 1982 Colonial evangelism. A socio historical study of an East African Mission at the grass roots Bloomington: Indiana University Press
- Bendix R 1966 Max Weber An intellectual portrait London: Methuen
- Bentley B 1991 Interview Bentley is a commercial farmer near Mwinilunga
- Berendson W 1991 Interview Berendson is a commercial farmer near Kasempa

Bond GC 1987 'Religion, ideology and property in Northern Zambia' In: Markovitz IL Studies in power and class in Africa Oxford: Oxford University Press

Burnett D 1990 Clash of worlds MARC: Eastbourne

Burridge K 1972 'Cargo' In: Maranda P (ed) Mythology Middlesex: Penguin education

Casley and Kumar 1987 Project monitoring and evaluation in agriculture London: John Hopkins University Press

Clay EJ and Schaffer BB 1984 Room for manoeuvre. An exploration of public policy planning in agriculture and rural development London: Heinemann

Crehan KAF 1986 Production, reproduction and Gender in North Western Zambia: a case study PhD thesis. University of Manchester

Cross S 1973 The watchtower movement in South Central Africa 1908 - 1945 D Phil Thesis presented to the board of the faculty of social studies, Oxford University

Cross S 1992 In course of lectures on politics, planning and development at the University of East Anglia

CSO 1990 Republic of Zambia country profile 1989/90 Central Statistical office, PO Box 31908, Lusaka, Zambia

CSO 1990 Census of population, housing and agriculture. Preliminary report Central statistical office, PO Box 31908, Lusaka, Zambia

Durkheim E 1972 Emile Durkheim selected writings (ed Anthony Giddens) London: Cambridge University Press

Durkheim E 1977 The evolution of educational thought London: Routledge and Kegan Paul

Evans-Pritchard EE 1976 Witchcraft oracles and magic among the Azande Oxford: Clarendon Press

Foulkes J 1990 In conversation, Foulkes is a medical doctor at Mukinge mission hospital

FRG (Federal Republic of Germany) No date given The integrated rural development programme in the North Western Province of Zambia Federal Republic of Germany press and information office of the federal government

Geschiere P 1985 'Imposing capitalist dominance through the state: The multifarious role of the colonial state in Africa' In: Binsbergen WV and Geschiere P (eds) Old modes of production and capitalist encroachment. Anthropological explorations in Africa

Gitari DM 1986 'The churches witness to the living God in seeking just political, social and economic structures in contemporary Africa' In: Gitari and Benson (eds) Witnessing to the living God in contemporary Africa. African Theological Fraternity

Gluckman M 1970 'The logic of African science and witchcraft' In: Marwick M (ed) Witchcraft and sorcery UK: Penguin education

Goulet D 1971 The cruel choice. A new concept in the theory of development New York: Atheneum

Hall TC 1959 The religious background of American culture New York: Frederick Ungar Publishing Co

Hart G 1989 'The growth linkages controversy: some lessons from the Muda case' Journal of Development studies 25 (4) 1989

Hastings A 1979 A history of African Christianity 1950 to 1975 African studies series 26 Cambridge: Cambridge UP

Holy L 1986 Strategies and norms in a changing matrilineal society Descent, succession and inheritance among the Toka of Zambia Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Hook S 1955 Marx and the Marxists London: D. Van Nostrand Company, inc.

Hooker JR 1965 'Witnesses and the watchtower in the Rhodesias and Nyasaland' Journal of African history VI I (1965) pp91 - 106

- Jaeger D 1981 A human geographical study of the Kaonde, Kasempa District, Zambia Ph.D. thesis. University of Amsterdam Pub.: Royal Tropical Institute, Amsterdam
- Jaeger D 1992 In conversation, Jaeger is the author of a PhD thesis about the Kaonde
- Justice J 1986 Policies, plans and people Culture and health development in Nepal London: University of California Press
- Kant I 1981 Grounding for the metaphysics of morals Translated by Ellington JW Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Kaposa B 1991 Interview Kaposa was deputy to the one in charge of Mumena front line youth project in 1991
- Kluckhohn C 1962 Culture and behaviour New York: The Free Press
- Leonard DK 1987 'The political realities of African management' In: World Development, 15 (7), pp899-910
- Livingstone D 1857 Missionary travels and researches in South Africa London: Ward Lock and Co Ltd
- Long N 1968 Social change and the individual Manchester: Manchester University Press
- Low A 1986 Agricultural development in Southern Africa London: James Currey
- Manyando M 1990 In conversation, Manyando is the farm manager of the Kasempa farm training centre.
- Masua E 1991 Talk given at ECZ annual retreat, 1991. Masua was at one time the bishop of the ECZ
- Mayer P 1970 'Witches' In: Marwick M (ed) Witchcraft and sorcery UK: Penguin education
- McClelland DC 1976 The achieving society London: John Wiley and sons
- Melland FH 1920 Letter from Melland FH to Foster C on 11th September 1920 In: Wilkin PD 1983 To the bottom of

the heap: educational deprivation and its social implications in the North Western Province of Zambia 1906-1945 PhD thesis London: University Microfilms International

Melland FH 1923 In witch bound Africa. An account of the primitive Kaonde tribe and their beliefs London: JB Lippincott Company

Midgley J (ed) 1986 Community participation, social development and the state London: Methuen

Nelson-Richards M 1978 Where development agents fail. A study of the sociology of rural development in Zambia Nairobi: Africa Book Services

Ngalande E 1991 Interview, Ngalande is an improved farmers near Kasempa, NWPZ

Nicholds N 1992a In conversation, Nicholds works for the Overseas Development Institute

Nicholds N 1992b Dilemma's in relief and development Seminar UEA 19.06.92

Parkin DJ 1972 Palms, wine and witnesses. Public Spirit and private gain in an African farming community London: Intertext books

Pijnenburg B 1991 In conversation, Pijnenburg is the Research Extension Liason Officer for the Adaptive Research Planning Team, Kabompo IRDP

Richards AI 1939 Land, labour and diet in Northern Rhodesia. An economic study of the Bemba tribe London: Oxford University Press

Sayer D 1991 Capitalism and modernity. An excursion on Marx and Weber London: Routledge

Short R 1972 African sunset London: Johnson publications

Siame D 1991 Interview Siame was previously the manager of the Kabompo IRDP

Stanley B 1990 The bible and the flag. Protestant missions and British imperialism in the 19th and 20th centuries Leicester: Apollos

Sundkler BGM 1961 Bantu prophets in South Africa Second edition London: Oxford University Press

Times of Zambia 1989 Article entitled Witchcraft

Tocqueville AD 1945 Democracy in America Canada: Ryerson Press

Tulopa 1991 Interview Tulopa is an improved farmer near Kasempa

Turner HW 1980 African independent Churches and economic development World Development 8 pp523-533

Warner RS 1973 'Webers sociology of non western religions' In: Green RW (ed) Protestantism, capitalism and social science The Weber thesis controversy Second edition London: DC Heath and Co

Weber M 1978 'Value judgements in social science' In: Runciman WG (ed) Max Weber selections in translation Cambridge: Cambridge UP

Wilkin PD 1983 To the bottom of the heap: educational deprivation and its social implications in the North Western Province of Zambia 1906-1945 PhD thesis London: University Microfilms International

Williams A 1990 'A growing role for NGOs in development' Finance and development December 1990

Williams H 1988 Concepts of ideology UK: Wheatsheaf books ltd

Biblical references

From the New International Version.

Acts of the Apostles chapter 10

Galations chapter 2 verse 10

Galations chapter 3 verse 28

Matthew chapter 7 verse 12

Matthew chapter 28 verse 19